

**MINUTES**  
**MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS**  
**BUSINESS MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE**  
**METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY**  
**September 24, 2015**

The Board of Directors Business Management Committee met on September 24, 2015 at 10:59 a.m. in the Board Room on the 6<sup>th</sup> Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

**Board Members Present**

Roberta Abdul-Salaam  
Robert F. Dallas  
Jim Durrett, *Chair*  
Roderick E. Edmond  
Jerry Griffin  
Freda B. Hardage  
Barbara Babbit Kaufman

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/CEO Keith T. Parker; Chief Operating Officer Richard A. Krisak; Chief Financial Officer Walter Jones (Acting); Chief of Staff Rukiya S. Thomas; Chief Counsel Johnathan Hunt (Acting); AGMs Robin Henry, Ming Hsi, Reginald Mason, Terry Thompson and Donald Williams (Acting); Executive Director Ferdinand Risco; Sr. Directors Joseph Erves and Amanda Rhein; Directors Lisa DeGrace and Donna Jennings; Finance Administrative Analyst Tracy Kincaid. Others in attendance Davis Allen, Frederick Askew, Denise Coleman, Abebe Girmay, Aston Greene, Nicolas Gowens, Srinath Remala.

Also in attendance were Pamela Alexander of LTK Engineering; Jamie Fischer of GRTA.

**Consent Agenda**

---

- a) Approval of the August 27, 2015 Business Management Committee Meeting Minutes
- b) Resolution Authorizing the Solicitation of Proposals for Insurance Brokerage Services, RFP P36396
- c) Resolution to Approve the Disposition of MARTA Parcel D3193, a Permanent Drainage Easement and Temporary Construction Easement at Chamblee Station Lot 1

On motion by Mrs. Hardage seconded by Mrs. Abdul-Salaam, the Consent Agenda was unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 7 members present.

**Individual Agenda**

**Resolution Authorizing the Award of RFP P33683 to InSite Wireless Group for the Construction and Operation of a Cellular Wireless Network**

Mrs. Hsi presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to award a contract to InSite Wireless Group for the construction and operation of a Cellular Wireless Network.

On motion by Mr. Griffin seconded by Mrs. Hardage, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 7 members present.

**Resolution Amending the Award of Contract CP P35742 to Ascentra under GSA Schedule GS-07F-0075X for MARTA's Threat and Vulnerability Assessment Training and Exercise**

Lt. Greene presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to amend the existing Consulting Services Contract, CP P35742, with Ascentra, to conduct Emergency Preparedness Planning, Training, and Exercises from July 11, 2015 through January 30, 2019 with an increase cost of \$3,776,358.08 for a total amount of \$4,184,613.00.

On motion by Mr. Griffin seconded by Mrs. Hardage, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 7 to 0, with 7 members present.

**Briefing – DBE Program Review Part II**

Mr. Risco presented MARTA's DBE Program Briefing, Part II.

*DBE Program Update*

- FY 2015-2017 DBE Goal – 30%
  - Race Conscious – 25%
  - Race Neutral – 5%
- Current DBE Goal Attainment
  - Race Conscious – 26.2%

- Race Neural – 5.3%

*Program Results – Five-Year DBE Goal Attainment (FY 2010-2014)*

- FY 2010
  - Actual Goal – 26.3%
  - Goal Attained – 24.56%
- FY 2011
  - Actual Goal – 26.3%
  - Goal Attained – 18.50%
- FY 2012
  - Actual Goal – 27.75%
  - Goal Attained – 26.69%
- FY 2013
  - Actual Goal – 27.75%
  - Goal Attained – 25.10%
- FY 2014
  - Actual Goal – 27.75%
  - Goal Attained – 29%

*Program Results – Dollars Spent with DBEs/SBEs (FY 2010-2014)*

- FY 2010
  - Dollars spent with DBEs/SBEs - \$28.64M
  - Total - \$197.64M
- FY 2011
  - Dollars spent with DBEs/SBEs - \$46.49M
  - Total - \$240.91M
- FY 2012
  - Dollars spent with DBEs/SBEs - \$37.86M
  - Total - \$178.55M

- FY 2013
  - Dollars spent with DBEs/SBEs - \$26.99M
  - Total - \$258.44M
- FY 2014
  - Dollars spent with DBEs/SBEs - \$48.32M
  - Total - \$263.97M

*Program Results – Awards to DBEs & SBEs as Prime Contractors (FY 2010-2014)*

- FY 2010 – \$1.05M
- FY 2011 – \$0.92M
- FY 2012 – 6.77M
- FY 2013 – \$4.99M
- FY 2014 – \$10.20M

*Program Results – Dollars Spent by Ethnicity (FY 2014-2015)*

- Asian Male
  - FY 2014 – \$10.04M
  - FY 2015 – \$3.67M
- White Female
  - FY 2014 – \$10.02M
  - FY 2015 – \$14.88M
- Black Male
  - FY 2014 – \$8.85M
  - FY 2015 – \$11.40M
- Black Female
  - FY 2014 – \$6.41M
  - FY 2015 – \$1.45M
- Hispanic Male
  - FY 2014 – \$1.51M

- FY 2015 – \$1.90M
- Asian Female
  - FY 2014 – \$0.98M
  - FY 2015 – n/a

***2013 – 2014 Contract with Zero Goal***

- 2013
  - Contracts with 0% - 13
  - Total Dollar Value - \$27,531,126
  - Dollar Value Sole Source/GSA/State of Georgia/Single Source - \$1,225,159
- 2014
  - Contracts with 0% - 13
  - Total Dollar Value - \$11,659,964
  - Dollar Value Sole Source/GSA/State of Georgia/Single Source - \$3,517,498
- Zero Goal Justification
  - No DBEs certified in the scope of work functions identified
  - State of Georgia or General Services Administration Schedules (GSA) procurement (bidders/proponents are prequalified)
  - Justification approved for Single and Sole Source procurements

***Program Results – Contracts Awarded to African Americans (FY 2010-2014)***

- FY 2010
  - Number of Contracts - 30
  - Total Dollar Amount of Contracts - \$23,816,415
  - % of Total Dollars Spent - 22%
- FY 2011
  - Number of Contracts - 29
  - Total Dollar Amount of Contracts - \$23,782,992
  - % of Total Dollars Spent - 10%
- FY 2012

**Business Management Committee**  
**9/24/15**  
**Page 6**

- Number of Contracts - 43
- Total Dollar Amount of Contracts - \$32,702,080
- % of Total Dollars Spent - 18%
- FY 2013
  - Number of Contracts - 25
  - Total Dollar Amount of Contracts - \$20,512,811
  - % of Total Dollars Spent - 16%
- FY 2014
  - Number of Contracts - 23
  - Total Dollar Amount of Contracts - \$13,770,213
  - % of Total Dollars Spent - 17%

***DBE Success***

- Art Center Roof Rehabilitation
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 10%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 30%
- HVAC Building Maintenance
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 25%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 100%
- Location Service for MARTA Electric
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 20%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 100%
- Mystery Customer Program
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 30%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 100%
- Station Vending Services
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 30%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 100%
- General Professional Services – IT

- DBE Goal Assigned – 35%
- DBE Goal Achieved – 92%
- North Avenue Station Low Voltage Replacement
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 5%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 12%
- Janitorial Services MARTA HQ Complex
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 25%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 88%
- Furnishing and Installing AC Track Circuit Upgrade
  - DBE Goal Assigned – 0%
  - DBE Goal Achieved – 10%

*Top 10 Transit Agencies DBE Goal Attainment (FY 2014)*

- New York City Department of Transportation
  - FY14 Goal – 11.4%
  - Attainment – 11%
- Los Angeles County Metropolitan Transportation Authority
  - FY14 Goal – 27%
  - Attainment – 13%
- Chicago Transit Authority
  - FY14 Goal – 25%
  - Attainment – 26%
- Miami-Dade Transit Agency
  - FY14 Goal – 21%
  - Attainment – 44%
- Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority
  - FY14 Goal – 14%
  - Attainment – 14%
- Dallas Area Rapid Transit

- FY14 Goal – 25%
  - Attainment – 53%
- Metropolitan Transit Authority of Harris County, TX
  - FY14 Goal – 16%
  - Attainment – 28.8%
- Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority
  - FY14 Goal – 25%
  - Attainment – 33%
- Metropolitan Atlanta Rapid Transit Authority
  - FY14 Goal – 27.75%
  - Attainment – 29%
- Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority
  - FY14 Goal – 14%
  - Attainment – 16%

*Upcoming Opportunities*

- System Engineering
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$19,376,000
  - DBE Goal – 15%
- Vehicle Consulting Services
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$21,000,000
  - DBE Goal – 30%
- Safety Specialist
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$5,346,000
  - DBE Goal – 35%
- Communications and Electrical
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$7,118,000
  - DBE Goal – TBD
- Operations and Maintenance



- Estimated Contract Value – \$3,217,500
  - DBE Goal – TBD
- Safety Certification
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$5,675,000
  - DBE Goal – 30%
- Program and Project Management
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$8,575,000
  - DBE Goal – TBD
- Architectural Services
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$2,645,000
  - DBE Goal – TBD
- Landscape Architecture
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$778,000
  - DBE Goal – TBD
- Avondale Station TOD
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$95,000,000
  - DBE Goal – 20%
- Edgewood/Candler Park TOD
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$55,000,000
  - DBE Goal – 20%
- King Memorial TOD
  - Estimated Contract Value – TBD
  - DBE Goal – 20%
- Arts Center Station TOD
  - Estimated Contract Value – \$97,496,464
  - DBE Goal – 25%
- Brookhaven/Oglethorpe University Station TOD
  - Estimated Contract Value – TBD

- DBE Goal – 20%
- Joint Development of Parcel D3103 at Chamblee Station
  - Estimated Contract Value – TBD
  - DBE Goal – 20%

*Program Results – MARTA and City of Atlanta (COA) Awards to Minorities (2014)*

- African American
  - MARTA – 17.38%
  - COA – 18.93%
- Women
  - MARTA – 19.41%
  - COA – 14.53%
- Hispanic
  - MARTA – 0.38%
  - COA – 1.40%
- Asian
  - MARTA – 12.77%
  - COA – 1.46%

*Local Program Results – Goal Attainment FY 2014*

- MARTA
  - Program Type – DBE
  - FY14 Goal – 27.75%
  - Attainment – 29%
- Clayton County
  - Program Type – SLBE
  - FY14 Goal – Construction, 30%; A/E, 20%
  - Attainment – Undetermined
- Fulton County
  - Program Type – No program

- FY14 Goal – 20%, aspirational
- Attainment – 20.34%
- City of Atlanta – Aviation
  - Program Type – ACDBE
  - FY14 Goal – 36%
  - Attainment – 54.91%
- City of Atlanta
  - Program Type – EBO
  - FY14 Goal – Construction, 20.5%; Professional Svcs., 26.4%
  - Attainment – 36.32%
- City of Atlanta
  - Program Type – SBE
  - FY14 Goal – 35%
  - Attainment – Undetermined
- Georgia Department of Transportation
  - Program Type – DBE
  - FY14 Goal – 15%
  - Attainment – 14%
- DeKalb County
  - Program Type – LSBE
  - FY14 Goal – 20%
  - Attainment – No results

***MARTA vs. City of Atlanta Minority Programs***

- Criteria 1 – Ownership
  - MARTA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE)/(ACDBE)
    - Jurisdiction: Federal 49 CFR Parts 23 and 26
    - Eligibility Criteria: For-profit business; 51% owned by a socially and economically disadvantaged individual(s); disadvantaged owners are U.S. citizens or lawfully admitted permanent residents of the U.S.

- City of Atlanta Equal Business Opportunity (EBO) Program
  - Jurisdiction: Local
  - Eligibility Criteria: Proof of minority or female status
- City of Atlanta Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program Application (A)
  - Jurisdiction: Local
  - Eligibility Criteria: Located outside the identified 20 county MSA
- City of Atlanta Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program Application (B)
  - Jurisdiction: Local
  - Eligibility Criteria: Located within the identified 20 county MSA
- Criteria 2 – Control
  - MARTA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE)/(ACDBE)
    - Jurisdiction: Federal 49 CFR Parts 23 and 26
    - Eligibility Criteria: For-profit business; Small Business Administration's (SBA) size standard and does not exceed \$23.98M in gross annual receipts for DBE (\$52.47M for ACDBEs)
  - City of Atlanta Equal Business Opportunity (EBO) Program
    - Jurisdiction: Local
    - Eligibility Criteria: African American Business Enterprise (AABE), Female Business Enterprise (FBE), Hispanic American Business Enterprise (HABE), Asian (Pacific Islander) American Business Enterprise (APABE); located in the identified 20 county MSA
  - City of Atlanta Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program Application (A)
    - Jurisdiction: Local
    - Eligibility Criteria: City of Atlanta Vendor Number; not currently 8(a) or HUBZone certified with the U.S. SBA
  - City of Atlanta Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program Application (B)
    - Jurisdiction: Local
    - Eligibility Criteria: City of Atlanta Vendor Number; currently 8(a) or HUBZone certified with the U.S. SBA
- Criteria 3 – Personal Worth

- MARTA Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE)/(ACDBE)
  - Jurisdiction: Federal 49 CFR Parts 23 and 26
  - Eligibility Criteria: Personal Net Worth less than \$1.32M
- City of Atlanta Equal Business Opportunity (EBO) Program
  - Jurisdiction: Local
  - Eligibility Criteria: N/A
- City of Atlanta Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program Application (A)
  - Jurisdiction: Local
  - Eligibility Criteria: Self-Certify
- City of Atlanta Small Business Enterprise (SBE) Program Application (B)
  - Jurisdiction: Local
  - Eligibility Criteria: Self-Certify

*MARTA, GDOT & City of Atlanta Minority Program Results (2014)*

- MARTA DBE
  - Minority Groups – Socially and Economically Disadvantaged
  - Program Goal – 27.75%
  - Goal Attained – 29%
- City of Atlanta EBO
  - Minority Groups – AABE, FBE, HABE, APABE
  - Program Goal
    - Construction
      - AABE – 17.5%
      - FBE – 13%
    - Professional Services
      - Minority (Asian, Hispanic, African America) – 18.1%
      - Females – 8.3%
  - Goal Attained – 36.32%
- City of Atlanta SBE

## **Business Management Committee**

**9/24/15**

**Page 14**

- Minority Groups – Self-Certify; Located in 1 of 20 designated counties
- Program Goal – 35%
- Goal Attained – 55.48%
- GDOT DBE
  - Minority Groups – Socially and Economically Disadvantaged
  - Program Goal – 15%
  - Goal Attained – 14%

Dr. Edmond commended MARTA staff on the substantial progress made in the DBE program. He added that it is important that people in the community know that they can do business with MARTA.

Mrs. Abdul Salaam asked what is ACDBE.

Mr. Risco said the acronym refers to the Airport Concessions DBE program.

Mr. Parker said MARTA continues to be challenged by a perception that many people have about the Authority's certification process. It does take quite a bit of work to become certified. However, some people do not apply simply due to the net worth criteria.

Mr. Risco said MARTA is moving towards automation which will make the process easier.

### **Briefing – FY2015 June Year End Close Budget Variance Analysis and Performance Indicators**

Mr. Jones briefed the Committee on the FY2015 June Year End Close Budget Variance Analysis and select Performance Indicators.

- The Authority ended the fiscal year positively, exceeding expectations on both revenues and expenditures
- For the month of June, revenues are favorable; primarily due to Federal Assistance
- The biggest cause of negative impact for the month is contractual services which are the cost side effect of technological advances
- Year-to-Date (YTD) budget variance is favorable with a nearly \$35M surplus
- Sales Tax is on target; approximately 7.7% better than last year
- Passenger Revenue exceeded budget – MARTA saw a 5% growth in Ridership

## **Business Management Committee**

**9/24/15**

**Page 15**

- Other Revenues are \$4.5M better than budget; primarily due to the Alternative Fuel rebate
- Expenditures are also favorable YTD despite Overtime expenses which are running high due to some vacancies
- Workers Compensation is disconcerting; however, under the leadership of Risk Management and Legal, MARTA was able to strengthen reserves – this turned out to be a negative impact with positive results
- MARTA did not have to rely on 50% Sales Tax as Expenditures were \$7.3M less than budget
- Cumulative Operating Expenses are on target
- Ridership is also on target, exceeding last year's rate
- Average Call Wait Time eclipsed results of last year's rate
- Call Abandonment Rate is better than last year
- Crime Rate is above target, 5.6% better than last year – statistical MARTA is one of the safest agencies in the nation

Mr. Griffin asked if the annual budget was amended to reflect Clayton County Sales Tax.

Mr. Jones said MARTA took a conservative approach and did not consider it in the FY15 budget but it is included in the FY16 budgets.

Mr. Durrett asked how long has MARTA had Q-Bus.

Mr. Krisak said it is in its second year.

### **Other Matters**

---

The FY2015 June Key Performance Indicators were provided to the Committee as information only.

**Adjournment**

---

The meeting of the Business Management Committee adjourned at 11:55 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Kellee N. McDaniel  
Sr. Executive Administrator to the Board